## Learning Health Systems: Using Patient-Reported Outcomes to Improve Care Delivery And Real-World Discovery Research



Sean Mackey, MD, PhD **Redlich Professor** Chief, Division of Pain Medicine Director, Stanford Systems Neuroscience and Pain Lab Stanford University http://paincenter.stanford.edu http://snapl.stanford.edu smackey@stanford.edu Twitter: @DrSeanMackey



#### Stanford University

## **Disclosures – Funding Sources**

### NIH Pain Consortium – Partial funding for CHOIR

HHSN 271201200728P

#### National Center of Complementary and Integrative Health (NCCIH)

- P01 AT006651
- R01AT008561

## National Institutes of Drug Abuse (NIDA)

- K24 DA029262
- T32 DA035165
- R01DA035484

#### **Redlich Pain Research Endowment**

Dodie and John Rosekrans Pain Research Endowment

#### No industry conflicts

## Pain is a Public Health Problem

*Relieving Pain in America A Blueprint for Transforming Prevention, Care, Education, and Research* 

- Up to \$635 billion annually
- Chronic pain can become a disease in its own right
- Reduces quality of life
- Undertreated
- Disparities in prevalence and care
- Need better data!

<u>http://www.iom.edu/Reports/2011/Relieving-Pain-in-America-A-Blueprint-for-</u> <u>transforming-Prevention-Care-Education-Research.aspx</u>







#### **Prevention & Care**

Increase substantially the accessibility and quality of pain care



**Population Research** 

Improvements in state and national data are needed

National Pain Strategy

**Disparities** 

Under-treatment and inappropri-

ate treatment of pain among

racial and ethnic minorities

**CMS** 

**Payers** 

**Services** &

Reimbursement

Public health entities have a role

in pain care and prevention

# Nursing Psychology PCP Pain MD APP PT

#### **Professional Education**

Improve professional education of all providers



#### Public Education & Communication

High quality, evidence based education programs for patients and the public



## Sandra with Complex Regional Pain Syndro (CRPS)

"It's that feeling, if you're digging through the bottom of a cooler, and you just get that burning sensation because your arm is so cold,"

#### Stanford University

How do you know whether you have made Sandra better?

How do you know when a certain treatment is better than another for a specific patient?



## The Problem with Randomized Controlled Trials and Chronic Pain



10% of persons with chronic pain qualify for clinical trials

## 90% do not qualify!!!

## RCTs do not generalize well....and do not address Sandra's condition



## The Systems Challenge and Complexity of Pain



From Ming Kao

#### *IOM Learning Healthcare Systems:*

"We seek the development of a **learning healthcare system** in which science, informatics, incentives and culture are aligned for continuous improvement and innovation"





Collaborative Information Registry

- Open source, open standard, highly flexible, and **free** health and treatment registry and platform for a Learning Health System (http://choir.stanford.edu)
- Point of care decision making
- Software based decision making
- Comparative effectiveness research
- Longitudinal outcomes research
- Pragmatic/real-world clinical trials
- Comprehensive assessment of:
  - Physical, psychological and social functioning and global health



## **CHOIR: System Features and Status**

- Easy to use data entry for patients, staff and clinicians
- Staff and patient engagement
- Clinical workflow support (e.g. notify patient of survey URL prior to clinical appointment)
- Point of care reporting
- Over 20,000 patients and 60,000 longitudinal data assessments
- Changed the culture of how we care for patients!









## Computer Adaptive Testing (CAT)

- Reduces time to characterize domain of interest
- Normative scores referenced to the US general population

Mean = 50, SD = 10





https://dhs.stanford.edu/spatial-humanities/comparing-population-density-and-wikipedia-density-on-gis-day/

## **Stanford Pain Management Center**

- Interdisciplinary, coordinated comprehensive approach to pain management
- Use of validated outcomes assuring optimal patient assessment and care
- Over 20,000 patient visits (2016)
- 21 Physician Pain Faculty All Boarded in Pain Medicine
  - Anesthesiology
  - Internal Medicine
  - Physiatry
  - Neurology
  - Addiction Medicine
- 4 Pain Psychologists Faculty
  - Pain Psychology training program
- Physical therapy, Nutrition, Biofeedback, Acupuncture
- Strong connection and translation with pain research group



Stanford University

## Stanford Pain Management Center: Integrated Comprehensive Model of Care



#### **Stanford Pain Management Center**

Pain Medicine Physicians, Pain Psychology, Physical Therapy, Nutrition, Acupuncture, Biofeedback, Nursing, Pain Registry, Research Infrastructure

Stanford University



## **Initial and Follow-Up Surveys**

#### Initial Survey – 22 min

- Demographics
- Prior Treatments, Pain Beliefs
- Interactive Body Map
- PROMIS 14 domain measures: •
  - Pain Intensity, Pain Behavior, Pain Interference, Fatigue, Physical Function, Depression, Anxiety, Sleep Disturbance, Sleep Related Impairment, Social Functioning
- Opioid Risk Tool
- Pain Catastrophizing Questionnaire (PCS)
- Follow up Survey 9 min
  - Interactive Body Map
  - PROMIS 14 domain measures as above
  - PCS



CHOIR CAT		Legacy		Burden	
Domain	# Items CHOIR CAT v1	Instrument	# Items	Reduction	
Anger	$6.24 \pm 1.21$	Buss-Perry Aggression Questionnaire (BPAQ)	29	78%	
Anxiety	$4.93 \pm 0.97$	Generalized Anxiety Disorder 7-item (GAD-7)	7	30%	
Depression	$4.97 \pm 1.07$	Beck Depression Inventory II (BDI-II)	21	76%	
Fatigue	$4.78 \pm 0.76$	Functional Assessment of Chronic Illness Therapy-Fatigue (FACIT-F)	40	88%	
Physical Function	$4.11 \pm 0.48$	Health Assessment Quesionnaire-Disability Index (HAQ-DI)	20	79%	
Pain Interference	$4.19 \pm 0.71$	Brief Pain Inventory	7	40%	
Sleep Disturbance	$4.95 \pm 1.41$	Sleep Disorders Quesionnaire (SDQ)	12	59%	
Sleep-Related Impairment	$4.54 \pm 1.24$	Epworth Sleepiness Scale (ESS)	8	43%	
	38.7 ± 7.9		144	73%	

## Why not use **Epic** or your favorite electronic medical record (EMR)?

- Short version you can't do it.
- Computational complexity of modern patient reported outcomes (PROs) are beyond what can be provided by traditional EMR.
- With modern PROs, software decision support, and development of learning based systems, need rapid algorithm development and frequent code revisions.
- Solution is to off-load modern PRO processing/infrastructure to a separate system
- Also allows rapid development and implementation of features

## CHOIR's ability to rapidly iterate and improve

#### **EMR code review/release process**

- A necessity given the wide ranging critical roles of EMRs
- Typically measured in months

#### **CHOIR code review/release process**

- IOM released report on April 28, 2015
- Mackey sent to group at 3:14pm
- CHOIR Provider new Core Metrics user interface live on April 30, 2015 at 7:31am







- REDCap more project centric; CHOIR is more patient centric
- Patient experience is not performant (network and engine latency for official remote service)
- Significant customization required for automated assessments based on scheduled appointments
- Significant customization required for PDF physician reports
- No streamlined user interfaces and workflows for new patient coordinators and clinic front desk
- Details of how assessments are implemented (security, sessions, restarting where left off) are more carefully thought through than REDCap (biased opinion)

## #1 Reason for clinical informatics system failure: Lack of buy in



#### CHOIR Provider: Clinically useful reports and tools to aid assessment and decision making



## **CHOIR** as a Platform in Clinical Practice and Research



## **CHOIR** as a Platform in Pain Research and Clinical Practice



- •Generation of preliminary data
- •Dynamic studies of pain
- •Systems studies of pain
- •Comparative effectiveness
- •Large simple trials/pragmatic trials



- •Recording individual patient data
- •Dynamic treatment of pain
- •Systems treatment of pain
- •Learning based systems of pain

#### Stanford University

## **CHOIR: Using Dynamic Outcomes to Inform Care for Sandra**





## **CHOIR: Using Dynamic Outcomes to Inform Care for Sandra**









1 Jan 16

1 Mar 16

	painCatastrophizingScale	
	22 Nov 15	24
	24 Jan 16	12
1 M	06 Feb 16	2

## Physical Function and Pain Interference Only Weakly Related Over Treatment Course



In Review

## Using CHOIR to generate "research quality" clinical data

# Data with equal quality of a clinical trial



Quality data can be used for:

- Clinical trials
  - Pilot data
  - Large simple trial designs
- Clinical decision making
- Improving quality care and monitoring
- Comparative effectiveness research

#### Stanford University

Abernethy et al, Health Services Research, 2008

## Social satisfaction mediates pain-related emotional distress



Sturgeon, J. A., Dixon, E. A., Darnall, B. D., & Mackey, S. C. Contributions of Physical Function and Satisfaction with Social Roles to Emotional Distress in Chronic Pain: A Collaborative Health Outcomes Information Registry (CHOIR) Study. *Pain*. (2015)





The Journal of Pain, Vol 16, No 3 (March), 2015: pp 291-298 Available online at www.ipain.org and www.sciencedirect.com



Physical and Psychological Correlates of Fatigue and Physical Function: A Collaborative Health Outcomes Information Registry (CHOIR) Study

John A. Sturgeon, Beth D. Darnall, Ming-Chih J. Kao, and Sean C. Mackey Department of Anesthesiology, Perioperative and Pain Medicine, Stanford Systems Neuroscience and Pain Laboratory, Stanford University School of Medicine, Palo Alto, California.

Fatigue is:

• Common in chronic pain

PUBLISHED BY

ELSEVIER

- Understudied as a target of intervention
- Likely a confluence of physical and psychological factors
- A significant barrier to physical functioning, likely mediating effects of pain on physical dysfunction





-.406

Single Session Pain Catastrophizing Class to Reduce Pain

N=57 with chronic pain Single session class PCS = Pain Catastrophizing Scale

Time Point	PCS Mean (SD)
Baseline	26.1 (10.8)
Post-Treatment Week 2	16.5 (9.9)
Post-Treatment Week 4	13.8 (9.5)



Darnall, B, Sturgeon, J, Kao, MC, Hah, J, Mackey, S (2014). Journal of pain research, 7, 219.



## Jennifer M. Hah, <sup>1</sup> Yasanin Sharifaadeh, <sup>2</sup> Bing M. Wang, <sup>3</sup> Sean C. Mackey, <sup>1</sup> and Ian R. Carroll, Matthew J. Gillespic, <sup>2</sup> Jennifer M. Hah, <sup>1</sup> Yasamin Sharifzadeh, <sup>2</sup> Bing M. Wang, <sup>3</sup> Sean C. Mackey, <sup>1</sup> and Jan R. Carroll J **NOTE:** NOT: NO: NO: \* Peter Barelva, ND: \* Coarter Arriver And Ward, Bes, \* And **Characterizing Presurgical Factors that Predict Chronic Pain or Opioid Use**

Self-Loathing Aspects of Depression Reduce Postonerative Onioid Cessation Rate

Self-Loatning Aspects of Depression Postoperative Opioid Cessation Rate

Jennifer M. Hah, MD, H Charle W. Younger, PhD, Jeter L. Wang, BA, § Jarred W. Younger, PhD, Bing M. Ccue, BA,

Bing M. Wang, BA,§ Matthew J. Gillespie, Bp, , M. Wang, BA,§ Matthew J. Gillespie, PhD, Gillespie, PhD, Gillespie, PhD, FBSE, No. Wang, BA,§ Jarred W. Younger, PhD, W. Younger, PhD, W. Younger, PhD, FBSE, Stuart B. Goodman, ND, the Peter Stuart B. Goodman, ND, the Peter Stuart B. Goodman, ND, NS\* Stuart B. Carroll, ND, NS\* Stuart R. Carroll, ND, NS\*

A Pilot Cohort Study of the Determinants of

-6P

Factors Associated with Opioid Use in a Cohort of

lan R. Carroll, MD, MS, \*1

M. Dirbas MD FRCSC FACS

Keith Humphreys, PhD # red W. Younger, PhD\*

ACUTE & PERIOPERATIVE PAIN SECTION

measured pain and opioid use an patients reported the cessation Datteria " Proving and Dain. The Drive to opioid cessation, a previously reporter determinants

Original Research Articles

Surgery: An Inception Cohort Study

Pain Duration and Resolution following

surgery in c

Factors Associated with Opioid (

Imagine four patients whose pain or opioid use resolves...



Time (days)

Stanford University

## Factors Predicting Prolonged Opioid Use After Surgery

## **Reduction in rate of opioid cessation**

Preoperative opioid use: 73% reduction

Self-perceived risk of addiction: 53% reduction

Beck Depression Inventory, each 10-point increase: 42% reduction



Carroll I, Barelka P, Wang C, Wang B, Gillespie M, McCue R, Younger J, Trafton J, Humphreys K, Goodman S, Dirbas F, Whyte R, Donington J, Cannon W, Mackey S, *A pilot cohort study of the determinants of longitudinal opioid use after surgery*. <u>Anesth Analg</u>, 2012

Opioids

# Many surgeries associated with increased risk of chronic opioid use in opioid naïve patients

#### 641,941 patients undergoing one of 11 surgeries



Sun EC, Jena AB, Kao MC, Darnall BD, Baker LC, Mackey SC. *Incidence of and Risk Factors for Chronic Opioid Use Among Opioid Naïve Patients in the Perioperative Period* JAMA Internal Medicine 2016

## Factors Associated with Opioid Use in a Cohort of Factors Associated with Upioid Lunie with the set of **STCHOIR** Peri-Op

Ś

**Optimal Pre-habilitation for Surgery** 

Sesearch Article

Original Research Articles

lan R. Carroll, MD, MS, \*1 Charlie K. M. Wang, BS, F

Keith Humphreys, PhD, #

-rife Caroli, MD, MS, --rife K.M. Hah, MD, MS, --arred W. Younger, PBS, \* Bing M. Waretka, MD, \*, 1 - Stop \*, PBS, \* Bing M. Waretka, MD, \*, 1 - ..., s \* Jodie Tratton, PhO, 8, 4, 1

- 1 Fredrick M. Dirbas, MD, FRCSC, FACS,

Pain Duration and Resolution following

measured pain and opioid use an patients reported the cessation Datteria " Proving and Dain. The Drive to opioid cessation, a previously reporter determinants of surgery in c

Surgery: An Inception Cohort Study

# Jennifer M. Hah, <sup>1</sup> Yasamin Sharifaadeh <sup>2</sup> Bing M. <sup>1</sup>Vange 2015. Ander 10 active 2015. Ander 2015. Jennifer M. Hah, <sup>1</sup> Yasamin Sharifzadeh, <sup>2</sup> Bing M. Wang, <sup>3</sup> Sean C. Mackey, <sup>2</sup> Bing M. Wang, <sup>3</sup> N. Keith Humphreis, MD, MD, Suart B, Goodman, MD, MD, S Walter B, Cannon, MD, All Search Carl, MD, PhD, All Search Carl, MD, **Characterizing Presurgical Factors that Predict** Chronic Pain or Opioid Use ACUTE & PERIOPERATIVE PAIN SECTION



A Pilot Cohort Study of the Determinants of

Section Editor: Spencer S. Liu

#### Estimating hospital Length of Stay (LOS)

- LOS is the main driver of in-hospital healthcare cost
- Heritage Foundation
  - \$3M cash prize
  - *Outcome variable*: total hospital + ED LOS over the next year for individual patients
  - *Predictor variables*: comprehensive administrative dataset
  - Contest ran for 2 years, 2011-13



#### Results

- While there are clear leaders in the final leaderboard, no single variable proved to be the main driver
- General opinion:
  - Even the best performing model was unsatisfactory
  - No small subset of administrative variables percolated as the main driver
- Our opinion:
  - This data is plagued by highdimensionality, epidemiologic concerns, and inherent problems with administrative data (3 of the 6 Vs of Big Data)

#### Stanford University





#### **Peri-Operative CHOIR: Predicting LOS**

- Of the 2,073 patients seen at APEC, 991 have LOS at least 1 day
- Incorporated into generalized additive model and quantile regression
  - Race and ethnicity
  - Pre-op PROMIS measurements

#### Result

- Age, Gender, & Physical Function together significant
- LOS linearly increases as a function of worsening Physical Function effect despite adjusting for Age
- LOS significantly increases when Age is above 60







Age Stanford University

Test Defice 12	REGISTRY		- 40
MRN 10013-1	Weight: 1	75 lbs DOB 05/05/1975 A	der M
Contact number			
Best contact phone number to r	each you before surgery?	555-1234	
f this is not your phone, please	indicate whose phone number	it is My brothers	
Pre-Anesthesia Questionn	aire		
Anesthesia Pre-op Clinic visit in	the last 12 months	No	
Have had surgery at Stanford		Yes	
Past Surgeries			
ype of operation		Appendix removed	
Year of surgery		1992	
Anesthetic given: General an	esthesia	Yes	
Problems or side effects?		Yes	
Explain		Nausea and dizzyness when i w	/oke up
Type of operation		Broken ankle	
Year of surgery		2001	
Anesthetic given: General an	esthesia	Yes	
Problems or side effects?		Yes	
Explain		same as before	
Health Conditions			
Allergic to		foods	
Type of reaction		I get hives if I eat strawberries	
Corticosteroid use in last 6 mon	ths	No	
Personal or family history of and	esthesia complications	No	
Past medical history / Problems	not already documented in EM	IR High blood pressure	
Review of symptoms		palpitations or irregular heart be	ats,
		ankle swelling, difficulty walking	, acid
		reflex symptoms	
Acute Illness in last 2 weeks		Yes	
No hospitalization in the past 6	month	cold	
Smoking, Alcohol and Drug	rs		
Smoked 1 pack(s) per day 12 y	ears	Quit 2006	
o drink alcohol. More than 10	drinks per week Every day	3 drinks per day	
lave not used recreational drug	ns in the last 5 years	o uninto por day	
Duestions			
Questions for the anesthesiolog	list	No	
accounts for the anesthesiolog		110	
Pain Intensity: 0=No Pain,	10=Worst Pain Imaginable	)	
Vorst Av	verage Now	Least	
6 2	3	1	



COLLABORATIVE HEATTH OUTCOMES INFORMATION REGISTRY	SHC Pre-Anesthetic Ques	stionnaire Page 2
Test Patient13 MRN 10013-1	Height: 5' 6" Weight: 175 lbs	DOB 05/05/1975 Age 40 Gender M
PROMIS Physical Function		
oes your health now limit you in doing two hours of physical labor? low much do physical health problems now limit your usual physica re you able to do chores such as vacuuming or yard work? loes your health now limit you in walking more than a mile?	) al activities (such as walking or climbing stairs)?	Somewhat Quite a lot With some difficulty Quite a lot
(f)	PROMIS Outcomes Me	easures Score %ile Category



PROMIS Outcomes Measures	Score	%ile	Category
Physical Function *	62	88	
Pain Interference	61	86	
Depression	46	34	None/Minimal
Anxiety	53	62	Mild
Anger	48	42	
Fatigue	42	21	
Sleep Disturbance	31	3	None to Slight
* Scores and percentiles have been inverted			

9 areas selected on the most recent body map

#### **Research Paper**



September 2016 Volume 157 Number 9

## Pediatric-Collaborative Health Outcomes Information Registry (Peds-CHOIR): a learning health system to guide pediatric pain research and treatment

Rashmi P. Bhandari<sup>a,\*</sup>, Amanda B. Feinstein<sup>a</sup>, Samantha E. Huestis<sup>a</sup>, Elliot J. Krane<sup>a</sup>, Ashley L. Dunn<sup>a</sup>, Lindsey L. Cohen<sup>b</sup>, Ming C. Kao<sup>a</sup>, Beth D. Darnall<sup>a</sup>, Sean C. Mackey<sup>a</sup>

### Press-Ganey Patient Satisfaction and the Challenges of Chronic Pain



#### Medical Practice Satisfaction by Specialty

Based on 4,274,639 surveys received from 17,685 sites nationwide between 1/1/2012 - 12/31/2012. Only includes specialties used by 50+ facilities with 5,000+ patients. Only the "included sample" is included in this



Overall Mean Score



## **Collaborative** Health Outcomes Information Registry System To Enhance Patient eXperience (STEPx)

#### An unmet need

- Comprehensive capture of patient experience touchpoints
- Concise item stems
- Actionable results
- Integrated into CHOIR
- Open source and free

Covers, and extends, all the domains of existing patient satisfaction surveys, including:

- Press Ganey
- Hospital Consumer Assessment of Healthcare Providers and Systems (HCAHPS)
- TOPS





## Pain Clinic orientation video improves patient satisfaction





#### Stanford University











- Implemented in multiple clinics and academic sites nationally and internationally
- Genetics: Stanford GenePool
- National pain data repository across sites with governance
- Software based decision support
- Mobile device integration for daily experiential sampling.
- Quantitative sensory testing
- Adaptive randomization for pragmatic trials
- Open source (free) licensing with minimal restrictions



• NIH Pain Consortium

- Redlich Pain Research Endowment
- Stanford Center for Clinical Informatics

Collaborative Health Outcomes Information Registry

http://CHOIR.Stanford.edu

- Michael Halaas
- Susan Weber
- Garrick Olson
- Teresa Pacht

•

- Northwestern/PROMIS
  - Karon Cook, PhD
  - Stanford Systems Neuroscience and Pain Lab (SNAP
- All our collaborators!!!!!!





